

The origin of jiva
email discussion, May-June 2017
translation from cz

Jan:

Parama samhita about jiva falldown – see "the process of falldown"
<http://www.veda.harekrsna.cz/encyclopedia/tattvas1.htm#2>

Parama samhita is mentioned twice in SP purport to CC Adi 5.41, quoted from Sri Bhasya. It is not quoted in Sandarbhas or HBV.

Martin:

I have read through the whole chapter in context and it is obvious that the process of falldown concerns practitioners in this world. It is described at the chapter beginning very clearly and Brahmaji then asks in verse 82 for the clarification of the issue and asks:... does embodied man come back to a wordly life?...

Vishnu then clarifies the issue and again talks about the weaknesses on the path which can stop jiva on the way to the ultimate perfection.

J:

It is possible, but so far I understand it in the way that jivanmuktas are described up to verse 93. However, in verse 94 they are differentiated from those who have achieved sayujya mukti, which is standardly understood as videha mukti, a gateway to other types of mukti: they are kiMkarA mamate nityA. Yet they are endangered by aparadha (95), which can only be committed in service, not in Brahman. 96 describes those who have not fallen and according to 97 after return (after aparadha) to paramam padam there is no more infatuation (pramAda). BG 8.15-21, 15.4-6 etc.

Can you send it to an expert for comments? It would probably need to get screenshots of the whole Sanskrit chapter. [Parama samhita pp. 244–5 / 442]

M:

The first thing that did not fit me so much at first reading is just the verse 94 where Vishnu allegedly talks about Sayujya mukti. Generally sayujya is not something Vaishnava considers worthy of the attaining among other kinds of muktis, if it is meant here in this sense.

J:

I was also wondering what exactly is meant by that. Therefore I have suggested to you to ask someone about it, best someone who is familiar with Ramanuja's and other Sri Vaishnava texts.

M:

We even see that sayujya mukti is attained rather by asuras or desired by mayavadi jnanis. In CC is also written that sayujya mukti is outside Vaikuntha dhama, and it is the place of Brahmaloaka or Siddhaloka where jnanis reach brahma sayujya mukti. From there one can fall, also due to neglecting bhakti, then they fall.

J:

Yet in that verse it is clearly said "bhakty aparAdhena". Aparadha can only be committed in the service. Therefore sayujya, as we normally understand it, must be just the beginning stage before other kinds of mukti, as I wrote.

M:

If this connection of sayujya mukti in the verse is meant more like the attainment of unity with Supreme Brahman, then jivan mukta, who is still not fully realized, can commit aparadha, like mayavadi jnani, who at the beginning uses Vishnu as a process of attainment and then gives Him up as illusory...

J:

Only when the bhakti is present.

M:

Otherwise it would be interesting that after many centuries of Vaishnava sampradayas, their teachers and Goswamis like Jiva would not have found and used this as evidence.

J:

Probably GV acaryas didn't have this sastra available when they didn't quote it. Certainly they wouldn't neglect it as irrelevant. And overall, this jiva topic probably was not much in the center of interest, when it's not elaborated on in detail.

M:

When Krishna says that one who comes to Param Dhama never returns to the material world, He doesn't say those who return to Param Dhama...

J:

Those who have burned themselves will usually learn.

M:

For me those chapters of Bhagavatam that deal with Jay Vijay lila are quite clear. Yudhisthira, educated Brahmana, asks how can one fall from Vaikuntha and Krsna make it clear that it is lila. Prabhupada in purports to 3rd and 7th

canto says that it is fact that nobody falls from Vaikuntha. 3.15.48 From Vedic scriptures it is understood that even Brahma and Indra fall down, but a devotee in the transcendental abode of Lord never falls (purport).

The inhabitants of Param Dham are either the expansions of svarup shakti, or liberated Nitya siddhas having the Vaikuntha body, and there is only the visuddha sattva, there is no aparadha possible.

J:

And anything is possible in the lila. E.g. the mutual curse of Radha and Sridama in Tulasi lila. And they're the closest companions of Krisna. That was aparadha too.

M:

So that jiva falldown exists, but it begins where Bhaktivinode describes it in Jaiva Dharma.

J:

Although those statements are not too specific, they are consistent:

When jiva forgets this truth he is enslaved by `maya', from that moment on jiva turns away from Krsna---he rejects Him. From the time jiva comes into this material world he has already rejected Krsna, and so there are no historical statements recording his fall down. This truth justifies the use of the phrase--- `anadi bahirmukha' (eternally turned away from the spiritual realm).

The instant jiva rejects Krsna and embraces material existence his eternal religion becomes perverted. (Jaiva Dharma, kap. 1)

One who has denied his relationship to Krsna, or is turned away from Him and is eternally in the clutches of maya is in samsara, or entangled material condition. (Jaiva Dharma, kap. 7)

Babaji: Standing between them, the soul can see these two worlds. The "tatastha" nature of the souls refers to the fact that they must be under the control of one of these two potencies. The actual place of the "tat~a" (shore may change. What was once dry land may be covered with water, and what was once covered by water may again become dry land. If he turns his gaze upon Lord Krsna, the soul comes under the shelter of Lord Krsna's spiritual potency. But if he turns away from Krsna and turns his gaze to the material potency, maya, then the soul is caught in maya's trap. That is what is meant by "the soul's tat~astha nature". (Jaiva Dharma, kap. 15)

The souls that thus enter Maya's abyss are not interested in their own spiritual well-being. They are averse to Lord Krsna and interested in their own selfish pleasure. (Jaiva Dharma, kap. 16)

Maya' is a maidservant of Krsna and she chastises and cures the errant conditioned souls who are turned away from Krsna. When 'jiva', who is a fully spiritual entity, forgets his position as an eternal servant of Krsna he unnecessarily commits a grievous blunder. It is due to this aberration that 'jiva' is sentenced to repeated punishment, carried out by 'maya'. (Jaiva Dharma, kap. 16)

"Turned away" is from SB 11.2.37.

The individual souls are very weak. How can this not be? **These souls did not obtain the spiritual strength that comes from the Lord's mercy, mercy that comes from properly serving Him. That is why these souls develop a desire to enjoy the pleasures that Maya offers.** (Jaiva Dharma, kap. 16)

"Properly serving" can mean "without aparadha". And aparadha can also be unaware, see the case of Rupa Gosvami in Bhakti-ratnakara, the end of Mathura-mandala-parikrama.

M:

The 15th chapter of Jaiva Dharma demonstrates where the turning away of jiva from Krishna happens. It is not in Vaikuntha. The descriptions of jiva fall down as described by Prabhupada or Bhaktisiddhanta refer to this.

J:

Where exactly? By the way, are you aware that there are two versions of JD?

<http://krishna1008.blogspot.com/2017/03/the-false-version-of-jaiva-dharma-being.html>

But in the first verse quoted in this chapter (from Dasa mula 5) they agree, see the last sentence:

sphuliGgA RddhAgnar iva cid-aNavo jIva-nicayA
hareH sUryasyaivApRthag api tu tad-bheda-viSayAH
vaze mAyA yasya prakRti-patir evezvara iha
sa jIvo mukto 'pi prakRti-vaza-yogyaH sva-guNataH

"As sparks fly from a blazing fire, or rays of light fly from the sun, so the individual spirit souls come from the Supreme Personality of Godhead, Lord

Hari. As the sparks and rays of light are at once different and not different from their source, so the individual souls are different and not different from Lord Hari. Lord Hari is the supreme controller. He is the master of the material world. The illusory potency mAyA is under His control. The individual soul is not like Him. Even when he is liberated, the soul is capable of coming under mAyA's control."

sphulingah rddhagneriva cidanavo jivanicayah hareh
suryasyaiva-parthagapitvad bhedovisayah vase maya yasya
prakrtipatirevesvara iha sa jivo mukto'pi prakrtivasayogyati svagunatah

Out of the flames fall innumerable little sparks; similarly from the rays of the transcendental sun Lord Hari emanate millions of minute particles of light, the infinitesimal spirit soul – jiva. Jiva is non-different from the supreme Lord Hari and yet simultaneously he is eternally distinct from the Lord. The eternal difference between the supreme Lord and jiva is that the lord is always the master and controller of maya-sakti, whereas jiva, even in his liberated state, is by his very nature vulnerable to come under maya's survey.

Another thing is that the central pramana is sastra – CC 2.20.352 p.

M:

Goswamis did not feel the need to mention such things because from here and from other information everyone understood from where jiva comes from.

J:

Well, if it was so clear, it wouldn't turn into a controversy, would it?

But the fall of jiva is also dealt with by acaryas of other sampradayas, see <http://www.veda.harekrsna.cz/library/JivaSoul.zip>

If the jivas had not previously been with Krsna, verse describing the turning away from Krsna, SB 11.2.37, would not apply. Bhavartha dipika clearly speaks of svarupa (see also 2.10.6):

nanu kim evaM paramezvara-bhajanena, ajJAna-kalpita-bhayasya jJAnaika-nivartyatvAd ity AzaGkyAha, bhayam iti. yato bhayaM tan mAyayA bhaved ato budho buddhimAMs tam evAbhajat. nanu bhayaM dehAdy-abhinivezato bhavati, sa ca dehAhaGkArataH, sa ca svarUpAsmaraNAt kim atra tasya mAyA karoty ata Aha, IzAd apetasyeti. Iza-vimukhasya tan mAyayAsmRtir bhagavataH svarUpAsphUrtis tato viparyayo deho 'smIti tato dvitItyAbhinivezAdbhayaM bhavati, evaM hi prasiddhaM laukikISv api mAyASu. uktaM ca bhagavatA, "daivI hy eSA guNa-mayI mama mAyA

duratyayA. mAm eva ye prapadyante mAyAm etAM taranti te.” iti. ekayA
'vyabhicAriNyA bhaktya bhajet. kiM ca guru-devatAtmA gurur eva devatA
Izvara Atma preSThaz ca yasya. tathAdRSTiH sann ity arthaH.

BSST bypassed this problem (that they would not be with Krisna) in the
commentary to Brahma-samhita 5.16, quoted on VEDA under Parama samhita.
And he says they emanate from Supersoul ("oversoul"), not from Mahavisnu.

M:

In another place of JD it is described that jiva is an expansion of Mahavisnu's
energy. Expansions for Vaikuntha are of a different category and they are perfect
by their nature, fully anchored and endowed with spiritual potency, thanks to
which they do not fall.

J:

Parsadas are sakti tattva and do not fall but they come here in the course of lila
to liberate all, including those on the lowest level.

One Madhva follower in a debate wrote: "Liberated souls do not come to Earth
and take birth as per Madhvacharya and also as per Sruti. They are not subject to
any curses also." and I replied to him with verse SB 11.12.4, which clearly
mentions "rajah-tamah-prakrtayah" jivas among those who are liberated to "mat
padam", Lord's abode by association with Lord's devotees.

Other verses – not quoted because he left the debate – are SB 2.4.18, 3.5.21,
10.87.46 or Isvara samhita 8.175-7:

ekAntino mahAbhAgAH zathakopa-puras sarAH
kSonyAm krir-AvatArA ye lokojjIvana-hetunA
zAndilyAdyAz ca ye cAnye paJcarAtra-pravartakAH
prahlAdaz caiva sugrIvo vAyusUnur vibhUSanaH
ye cAnye sanakAdyAz ca paJcakAla-parAyanaH

Sathakopa and others, great devout saints, became incarnate on earth to save
creatures. Sanaka and others, Sandilya and others, Prahlada, Sugriva, the Wind-
Son (Hanuman), Vibhisana and others – the strict observers of the five-timed
injunctions (pancakala) – these are the promulgators of the Pancaratra.

M:

Otherwise I don't think that Parama samhita would not be known to Goswamis,
who were empowered by Krsna. sarva sastra vicaranaika nipunau sat dharma
samsthapakau.

J:

How else to prove that some sastra was available to them than from their quoting it? Glorificatory song is glorificatory song.

M:

Aparadha in the lila is just Krsna's arrangement for His special lila as Prabhupada explains on the Jaya Vijaya story.

J:

This "just" needs to be supported by evidence in detail.

M:

What I am currently wondering about is that we usually hear that the material world is made for the enjoyment of jiva but when Narayan wants to tear His devotee to pieces He does it here and not in Vaikuntha. And the special Goloka is revealed right here, where Yasoda can have Krsna as a little child... somewhere in Bhagavatam it is said that Krishna is always the first in everything, and so it seems that material worlds are for His enjoyment.

J:

Of course, He is bhoktA/bhoktri, and allows jiva to enjoy:

"Foolish demons are envious of Krsna, the Lord of the Universe, but He bestows all enjoyment on those who desire it. He gives all wealth to the greedy, He is the very form of bliss for those who desire happiness and He bestows sovereignty to those who want to rule the world." (They bite the hand that feeds them)
(Govinda lilamrta 17.28)

In Vaikuntha there is no suitable environment for violent lilas so bhauma lila is more varied.

These words were spoken by the Lord of Vaikuntha to Jaya and Vijaya. To become free of their offense they must practice mystic yoga. Because they are by nature eternally perfect associates of the Lord, this entire incident was arranged so that the Lord would have the opportunity to enjoy pastimes of fighting with them. For this reason some consider that these activities of the Lord should be considered activities of devotional service. That is not true. Words like "bhakti" (devotional) and "seva" (service) are used when one has a favourable relation with the Lord. They cannot be used when one is an enemy of the Lord. (Bhakti-sandarbha 324.7)

M:

Bhaktivinoda Thakura explains that the tatastha jivas emanate from Maha Vishnu. Here is the excerpt:

Babaji: ...Innumerable jivas appear from Sri Baladeva Prabhu to serve Vrindavana-vihari Sri Krishna as His eternal associates in Goloka Vrindavana, and others appear from Sri Sankarshana to serve the Lord of Vaikuntha, Sri Narayana, in the spiritual sky.

Eternally relishing rasa, engaged in the service of their worshipable Lord, they always remain fixed in their constitutional position. They always strive to please Bhagavan, and Page 26 of 45 are always attentive to Him. Having attained the strength of cit-sakti, they are always strong.

They have no connection with the material energy. In fact, they do not know if there is a bewildering energy called maya or not. Because they reside in the spiritual world, maya is very far away from them and does not affect them at all. Always absorbed in the bliss of serving their worshipable Lord, they are eternally liberated and are free from material happiness and distress. Their life is love alone, and they are not even conscious of misery, death or fear.

There are also innumerable, atomic, conscious jivas who emanate as rays in Karanodakasayi Maha-Vishnu's glance upon His maya-sakti.

Because these jivas are situated next to maya, they perceive her wonderful workings.

Although they have all the qualities of the jivas that I have already described, because of their minute and marginal nature, they sometimes look to the spiritual world, and sometimes to the material world. In this marginal condition, the jiva is very weak because at that time he has not attained spiritual strength from the mercy of the object of his worship.

Among these unlimited jivas, those who want to enjoy maya become engrossed in mundane sense gratification and enter the state of nitya-baddha. On the other hand, the jivas who perform cid-anusilanam of Bhagavan receive spiritual sakti by His mercy, and enter the spiritual world. JD, Chapter 16, Page 377-378

J:

Which edition is it? I have two, from which I have quoted, and this one is not among them. The first of my editions continues as follows:

Vrajanatha: O master, why did some souls leave the borderline of matter and spirit and enter the world of Maya? Why did other souls go to the spiritual world?

Babaji: Lord Krsna's own qualities are present in a very small degree in the individual spirit souls. Because Lord Krsna has free will, so the individual souls eternally possess a small quantity of free will also. When that free will is used properly, the individual soul is favorable to Krsna and turns toward Him. When the free will is misused, **the soul is averse to Krsna and turns away from Him**. Then the soul tries to enjoy Maya. Puffed up with petty pride, the soul

thinks, "I am the enjoyer of matter." Then the pure spiritual form of the soul becomes covered by the five kinds of ignorance that begin with illusion and false-ego. Thus is the proper or improper use of free will that bring us either liberation or imprisonment in the material world.

Second edition:

Vrajanath – "Dear master! 'jiva' is the marginal potency (of the Lord) and is situated on the margin. Why then are some 'jiva' engrossed in material existence while others are elevated to the spiritual sky?"

Babaji – "Supreme Lord Krsna's transcendental qualities are also present in the 'jiva', but in a very minute degree. Lord Krsna's quality of free will is therefore innate in the 'jiva' constitution and is microscopic in content. When 'jiva' makes proper use of their independence he remains in connection with Krsna, but **if he misutilizes it, he disassociates himself from the Lord** and becomes attracted to exploit and enjoy material nature. He develops the despicable quality of false pride, thinking – I am the enjoyer of all, I survey thus ignorance, illusion, great illusion, darkness, deep darkness – These five types of nescience cloud the 'jivas' pure spiritual consciousness. The sole cause of 'jiva' becoming conditioned or liberated is whether he properly uses or misuses his minute independence".

If the jiva's story would begin with Mahavisnu, then this conception is different from the sastras I quoted, including BSST in Brahma samhita. Mahavisnu is not Krisna.

Even Madhva's conception of nitya-suri and nitya-samsari speaks of forgetting Krsna by conditioned jivas:

Those separated parts in question are of two kinds, one who is ever free (what Madhva calls nitya suris) and the other is ever bound in samsara or repetition of birth and death, in worldly sensual enjoyment. These unfortunate souls, caught up in the pursuit for mundane pleasure, forget Krsna for some time, while the ever free souls who are known as Krsna parisada (Krsna's associates) never forget Him for even a moment. **Those who, by their nature and desires, have chosen to forget Krsna find themselves liable to be subjected to Krsna's external energy Maya**, who puts them through three kinds of sufferings —" (Jayatirtha Caran das: The Life and Legacy of Sripada Madhvacarya Bhagavatpada, Introduction)

Another argument is that sastras often mention a temporary, even though very long stay in Vaikuntha for certain merits, see HBV. According to one

explanation it is prapanca Vaikuntha in the material world, but it is still the spiritual world.

M:

Prabhupada clearly says in many places that Vaikuntha inhabitants never fall and it is the conclusion of all vedic scriptures. That is fully understandable to me. Acaryas have never used the meaning of sastra in the meaning of jiva fall, the controversy arose only with the approach of Isckon, before no one had a problem. Yudhisthira in Bhagavatam is also acarya for me and Krsna explains to him that the fall of JayVijay is lila, so Yudhisthira's wonder that someone could fall from the spiritual world directly explained the greatest authority.

J:

I already explained this by quotes. It is not possible to talk about a fall in case of parsadas. By Krsna's wish a situation occurs where aparadha is committed and consequently the parsadas come to the material world. But they are still conscious of Krsna and by that they differ from us.

M:

It's a pity but now I do not have much time for computer to look up those things but many devotees already presented that sastric evidence of jiva coming from the energy of Mahavisnu, who is the expansion of Sankarsana, and I doubt that all were misled by some wrong translations.

J:

But exactly those pramanas need to be researched, because without them it is not a Vedic discussion, but just an intellectual play.

Jiva does not come from Mahavisnu, but from His source:

"Nevertheless the plow-carrying Sri Baladeva Prabhu is the personal manifestation of the Supreme Personality of Godhead, Gaura-Krsna; He is the predominating Deity of the sandhini energy, the original Sankarsana, the reservoir of all living entities, and the original source of all visnu-tattvas." (CBh 1.1.16, Gaudiya bhasya)

Maha-Sankarsana is the shelter of all jivas. Sankarsana is the original shelter of the purusa, from whom this world is created and in whom it is dissolved. (CBh 1.1.43, Gaudiya bhasya)

When presiding over the jiva-sakti, He expands as Sri Balarama, His vilasamurti, which is the expansion that assists Sri Krsna in His pastimes. (Jaiva dharma 15)

So what do they do in the interim before they reach Mahavisnu and are sent to Devi dham?

M:

Many times acaryas speak about Krsna, even if it refers to Visnu. Prabhupada also many times used this as I noticed, even Krsna in Gita also speaks in different places that it is Him, Krsna, when He refers to His Visnu lila.

J:

That's true. But from the rasa point of view Visnu is on a lower level than Krsna, the avatari (<http://www.veda.harekrsna.cz/encyclopedia/avatars.htm>). If someone claims that in a particular case Krsna means Visnu, he must present the pramana.

M:

About those mentions in sastras about going to Vaikunthu for a long time and then returning... I know one story from Kalki purana, where a king who had a lila with Kalki narrates how he and his wife were killed by a hunter by breaking their head with salagrams. Then they went to Vaikuntha. They came back here, but they were endowed with Krisna prema and took part in Kalki avatara pastimes. So no falldown lila.

J:

There are many such mentions, often without any further information what will happen after the return to Vaikuntha. See attached text (Appendix 1). To proclaim them to be exaggeration or Vyasa's preaching strategy requires sastra pramana.

Sarartha Darsini to 3.7.10, by the way, exactly fits that aparadha (tamas).

M:

Basically I wondered for long time about those parameters of tatastha situation and jiva that makes a decision there, but this article moved me a little forward that it was also the preaching strategy of BVT for people to have some idea. anadi karma.

<http://harmonist.us/2014/05/anadi-for-beginners-we-all-have-to-start-somewhere-or-do-we/>

There is also a lot of nice material to think about in the comments.

J:

Thanks. Adding it to my jiva folder of a few megabytes. I read the comments gradually, but aparadha as the cause of jiva's leaving nobody mentions, although it seems to me still more and more logical – and vice versa the fact that no one

considers it is still more and more incomprehensible to me. It's just the opposite direction of the path. Simply put: seva > aparadha > fall > removing aparadhas > seva. Solution to the whole problem is "hidden in plain sight".

Some comments on the article and its comments:

Tripurari M.: "The world cycles, its souls, and the karma that binds them together are all anadi, beginningless, as is Vishnu himself. Indeed, the world cycles are compared to his breathing, and God has no first breath."

This is refuted by Jnanamrtasara (Narada Pancaratra) description of the birth of Mahavisnu. Sastra yonitvat.

T.M.: "There is no first world cycle, and before each individual world cycle manifests, the infinite number of individual souls under the influence of karma remain within Mahavisnu in susupti, or deep sleep and content-less experience. At this time, their karma from the previous world cycle, which materially distinguishes them from one another, is still present, but in a dormant condition."

These are jivas already in the material world or on their way to it.

T.M.: "And sastra posits no condition of the baddha-jiva prior to susupti other than another previous world cycle."

And what about before it was baddha? See attached text (Appendix 1) and quotes above about the origin of jiva in Mahasankarsan Baladev.

Svakiya can hardly be considered a modern preaching strategy contrary to the siddhanta since it is described in sastras like Brahmavaivarta Purana.

Similarly, to declare BVT's statements of jiva's fall to be a preaching strategy, because once he used p.s. in the case of Krisna-samhita (no doubt of that), is not a good logic. In the case of Srila Prabhupada I do not know about any evidence of p.s. use.

T.M.: "Unlike the puranas that sometimes seek to motivate through fear or material prospect and thus exaggerate the results of impiety and piety to bring humanity in the religious direction,"

Where is the sastra pramana? (For example, Sanghas of T.M. were conspicuous by almost no quotes of any pramanas which prevented me from using their often interesting insights for VEDA.)

T.M.: "Bhaktivinoda Thakura points out an example of puranic exaggeration when he writes in his famous Bhagavat speech that while punishment and reward are certainly consequences of karmic engagement, the various descriptions of hells in the Bhagavatam are not to be taken as literal metaphysical truths, but rather constitute a preaching strategy."

However, NDEs confirm in detail the narrations of narakas from Puranas. I have two examples also at VEDA (Anatolij Todorov and our bhn. Subhadra). Bhagavat and Krishna samhita were just those examples of p.s. for the then English-influenced Bengalis (so-called bhadrakok).

In one of the comments under the article T.M. declares: "Srila Sridhara Maharaja's spoke of the brahmajyoti, tatastha, and susupti as the jiva's place from which it enters the world. All three cannot be correct. 1 and 2 are preaching. 3 is siddhanta. As you point out, Vrindaranya, the brahmajyoti is beyond the gunas, a liberated position."

However, his gurus say something else about brahmajyoti:

"Those who are in the brahman effulgence they are also in the fallen condition, so there is no question of falling down from a fallen condition." (SP letter to Revatinandana, L.A., June 13 1970)

"The fallen souls come from the marginal position within the brahmajyoti, and not from Vaikuntha." (B. R. Sridhar M. – Sri Krsna: Reality The Beautiful, 4)

"We are of a vitiated nature, but there are those who under no circumstances deviate from Krishna. They are the eternal paraphernalia of the Lord. They are not like us; they are eternally connected with Krishna, but **we are sometimes coming and going away**; we are unreliable servitors." (B. R. Sridhar M. – Sri Guru and His Grace, chapter Servant of the Servant)

According to them all three are correct (in brahmajyoti and then also in susupti within Mahavisnu are already fallen jivas). How would Krsna bahirmukha happen in susupti?

My conclusion: I consider T.M. one of sadhus with a certain view which must be supported by sastra pramana: CC 2.20.352 p.

One of the discussers under the article quotes BG 13.20 together with acaryas (and T.M.) to support that the conditioned jiva is in eternal contact with maya. But SP says in the purport (he does not take it from previous acaryas, as I verified): "Actually the living entity is originally the spiritual part and parcel of

the Supreme Lord, but due to his **rebellious nature**, he is conditioned within material nature. It really does not matter how these living entities or superior entities of the Supreme Lord have come in contact with material nature. The Supreme Personality of Godhead knows, however, how and why this actually took place."

Another claims "There is no starting point for things that exist outside of time or ending point." This is not true either, because Ananta samhita, for example, describes the creation of Navadvipa.

M:

One comment by Tripurari on where Prabhupada speaks siddhanta. It's interesting that is it without more information and it was presented as a fall from Goloka. I remember it in my case.

J:

Do you remember your fall from Goloka?

M:

Now I see where does it refer to...Swami BV Tripurari
<<http://www.swami.org>>

Here Srila Prabhupada explains what he really means when he says that jivas were previously with Krsna. They were in susupti, in sristi-lila.

“Regarding your second question, have the conditioned souls ever seen Krsna? Were they with the Lord before being conditioned by the desire to lord it over material nature? Yes, the conditioned souls are parts and parcels of the Lord and thus they were with Krsna before being conditioned.

Just as the child must have seen his father because the father places the child in the womb of the mother, similarly each soul has seen Krsna or the Supreme Father. But at that time the conditioned souls are resting in the condition called susupti which is exactly deep sleep without dream, or anesthetized state, therefore they do not remember being with Krsna when they wake up in the material world and become engaged in material affairs.”

Here SP gives the siddhanta.

J: However, here SP talks about already conditioned jivas... I recommend e.g. 4.28.55 or discussion after lecture from CC Adi 7.108, San Francisco, February 18, 1967:

Bhaktijana: When the souls were not conditioned at all..., do they also have the independence?

Prabhupada: Yes, but they have not misused. They know that "I am meant for Krsna's service," and **they are happy in Krsna's service.**

Bhaktijana: Could they ever misuse it?

Prabhupada: Yes, they can misuse it also. That power is there. Yes?

Here SP does not talk about nitya parsadas who do not fall, but about the jivas that may fall.

So maha-bhagavata, they know, they never forget this position, and those who are fallen souls, conditioned souls, they do not know it, they have to be raised to that stage. That stage, how? So he is also nitya-siddha. Nitya-siddha krsna-bhakti. Krsna-bhakti, as soon as one becomes Krsna conscious fully, he becomes nitya-siddha again. (SB 7.9.4, Mayapur, 11/02/1976)

This looks like a paraphrase of CC 2.22.107 (nitya siddha krsna prema sadhya kabhu naya).

PS: something from the recent

<http://krishna1008.blogspot.cz/2017/06/jadurani-narayana-maharaja-defeated.html>

M:

It should be understood that the jiva soul is neither produced of this material world, nor created in the transcendental world. They are originated from the marginal line between the transcendental and mundane spheres. (*Tattva Viveka* 2.4, by Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura, page 55)

Presented as translated and published in English by leading devotee scholars under the direction of Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Saraswati Thakura. Published by Gaudiya matha Madras.

J:

Tatastha is not some kind of space, it is just a comparison. It is tatastha sakti and its ability to function in both situations.

M:

The jivas have grown out of the *jiva-shakti* of Sri Krishna. *Chit-shakti* is Sri Krishna's full (plenary) *shakti,* whereas the *jiva-shakti* is the incomplete *shakti.* From the plenary potency are produced complete entities, but from the incomplete potency have grown the *jivas* as atomic *chit...* When he desired

to have His adherent attendance '*nitya parshada*' servitors in His Transcendental plane Goloka- Vrindavana, Vaikuntha, etc, He through Baladeva created those Eternal Parshada as '*nitya-mukta jivas*' at those divine worlds... Again at Paravyoma (Vaikuntha) He, as Sankarshana, reveals the eternally free associate '*jivas*' for the performance of the eight kinds of service to Sri Narayana. Maha Vishnu, the incarnation of Sankarshana, establishing Himself in the heart of '*jiva-shakti*' as Paramatma, '*creates*' the '*jiva-souls*' of '*tatastha shakti.*' These '*jivas*' are susceptible to the influence of '*maya*' ... As such, the '*conclusion*' is that it is the '*jiva-shakti*' that begets the '*jivas,*' and not the '*chit-shakti.*' " (Bhaktivinode Thakura, '*Jaiva Dharma,*' Chapter 15)

J:

"creates": regarding "creation" (manifestation) of the eternal:

yadyapi asRjya nitya cic-chakti-vilAsa
tathApi saGkarSaNa-icchAya tAhAra prakAza

Although there is no question of creation as far as the spiritual world is concerned, the spiritual world is manifested by the supreme will of Sankarsana. The spiritual world is the abode of the pastimes of the eternal spiritual energy.
CC 2.20.257

M:

Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakura:

Visnu has three energies, one of them is meant for manifestation of His eternal abode, another Potency is for creating all human souls who are '*emanations from His tatastha-sakti*' found between the temporal and eternal worlds. By this potency He creates human souls. The human soul has two different predilections. If he desires to serve Godhead he is allowed into the Eternal Region. If he desires to lord it over this world he comes down for enjoying in different capacities the products of the Deluding Potency. (Sri Caitanya's Teachings-Part II, Chapter One, Third Edition, p. 365–6 by Srila Bhaktisiddhanta)

J:

See tatastha sakti above.

M:

Tatastha has both the power of associating with temporal as well as eternal planes. Souls who have got their stations at tatastha have got free will. Each of the individual souls by exercising his free will can abuse or properly use his independence... The souls in the tatastha position are not one, but many in number. They are not to associate themselves with unalloyed Cit Sakti or

unalloyed Acit or Maya Sakti. In the tatastha position, souls do not show any activity but they are found to be in an indolent stage. (Sri Chaitanya's Teachings-Part II, Chapter One, p. 391–2, Third Edition)

The inconceivably narrow line of demarcation between land and water or the line where land and water meet is called *Tata*; so also the meeting line of the Cit world or the eternal abode of the Supreme Lord and the Acit world or the region of maya is called Tata. The power of the Supreme Lord displayed at the Tata is known as the *Tatastha* (lying at the Tata) or marginal power. All the jivas being the display of this power, have the inherent oscillating tendency and capability of going to the Cit or the Acit world. *Tata not being a resting place, jivas must go this side or that*... (From an English article by Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura and Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati entitled, Vaisnavism Real and Apparent, 10th paragraph)

CC Madhya 22.10 — “The living entities [j...vas] are divided into two categories. Some are eternally liberated, and others are eternally conditioned.

CC Madhya 22.11 — “Those who are eternally liberated are always awake to Krsna consciousness, and they render transcendental loving service at the feet of Lord Krsna. They are to be considered eternal associates of Krsna, and they are eternally enjoying the transcendental bliss of serving Krsna.

CC Madhya 22.12

“Apart from the ever-liberated devotees, there are the conditioned souls, who always turn away from the service of the Lord. They are perpetually conditioned in this material world and are subjected to the material tribulations brought about by different bodily forms in hellish conditions.

CC Adi 2.101 — “The cit-sakti, which is also called svarupa-sakti or antaranga-sakti, displays many varied manifestations. It sustains the kingdom of God and its paraphernalia.

CC Adi 2.102 — “The external energy, called maya-sakti, is the cause of innumerable universes with varied material potencies.

CC Adi 2.103 — “The marginal potency, which is between these two, consists of the numberless living beings. These are the three principal energies, which have unlimited categories and subdivisions.

CC Adi 5 uvod

The Personality of Godhead known as Sri Balarama in Krsnaloka is the original Sankarsana (attracting Deity), and from this Sankarsana expands another

Sankarsana, called Maha-sankarsana, who resides in one of the Vaikuntha planets. By His internal potency, Maha-sankarsana maintains the transcendental existence of all the planets in the spiritual sky, where all the living beings are eternally liberated souls...She is empowered to make the cosmic manifestation by the glance of Maha-Visnu. Therefore the material energy is not the original cause of the material manifestation. Rather, the transcendental glance of Maha-Visnu over material nature produces that cosmic manifestation.

Maha-Visnu again enters every universe as the reservoir of all living entities, Garbhodakasayi Visnu. From Garbhodakasayi Visnu expands Ksirodakasayi Visnu, the Supersoul of every living entity.

CC Adi 5.63 — Just as the original cause of an earthen pot is the potter, so the creator of the material world is the first purusa incarnation [Karanarnavasayi Visnu].

CC Adi 5.65 — The first purusa casts His glance at maya from a distance, and thus He impregnates her with the seed of life in the form of the living entities.

Bs 5.11 — The Lord of the mundane world, Maha-Visnu, possesses thousands of thousands of heads, eyes, hands. He is the source of thousands of thousands of avataras in His thousands of thousands of subjective portions. He is the creator of thousands of thousands of individual souls.

Bs 5.12 — The same Maha-Visnu is spoken of by the name of "Narayana" in this mundane world. From that eternal person has sprung the vast expanse of water of the spiritual Causal Ocean. The subjective portion of Sankarsana who abides in paravyoma, the above supreme purusa with thousands of subjective portions, reposes in the state of divine sleep [yoga-nidra] in the waters of the spiritual Causal Ocean.

CC Adi 5.14 — Beyond the material nature lies the realm known as paravyoma, the spiritual sky. Like Lord Krsna Himself, it possesses all transcendental attributes, such as the six opulences.

Purport: Beyond the manifested and unmanifested existence of material nature (*vyaktavyakta*) is the *sanatana* nature, which is called the *paravyoma,* or the spiritual sky. Since that nature is spiritual in quality, there are no qualitative differences there: everything there is spiritual, everything is good, and everything possesses the spiritual form of Sri Krsna Himself. That spiritual sky is the manifested internal potency of Sri Krsna;

FROM THIS IT IS OBVIOUS THAT KRSNA DHAMA, HIS INTERNAL ENERGY, HE HIMSELF AND INHABITANTS OF SPIRITUAL PLANETS ARE PERFECT. IT IS MAYAVADA TO ASCRIBE THEM SOME ERROR OR IMPERFECTION. THEREFORE NO BHAKTI APARADHA IN THE SPIRITUAL WORLD.

REFERENCES are many and many and they are primary references from sastras. CC says that primary references have the first place if Vedic knowledge is considered.

J:

The original condition of jiva is not unconscious: **Therefore originally the Rasas are exchanged between the spiritual living being with the spiritual Whole The Supreme Personality of Godhead.** (Srimad-Bhagavatam 1.1.3 p., edition 1962)

Added is a compilation about aparadha cases in Krsna lila and Caitanya lila (Appendix 2). Some are supposed and some real. Yet there are aparadhis, mayavadis and other asuras taking part in the lila. This supports the quote from Parama samhita, imho.

M:

tasya va etasya purusasya dve eva sthane bhavata idam ca paraloka-sthanam ca sandhyam trtiyam svapna-sthanam tasmin sandhye sthane tisthan ete ubhe sthane pasyati idam ca paraloka-sthanam ca

"The jiva-purusa should inquire about two locations, the material world and the spiritual world. The jiva is situated in a third position, called svapna sthana, on the border between these two places. Situated in this marginal place, he can see both the material and spiritual worlds". (Brhadaranyaka Upanisad 4.3.9)

J:

Whose translation it is?

Swami Nikhilananda:

9. "And there are only two states for that person: the one here in this world and the other in the next world. The third, the intermediate, is the dream state. When he is in that intermediate state, he surveys both states: the one here in this world and the other in the next world. Now, whatever support he may have for the next world, he provides himself with that and sees both evils (sufferings) and joys. "And when he dreams, he takes away a little of the impressions of this all-embracing world (the waking state), himself makes the body unconscious and

creates a dream body in its place, revealing his own brightness by his own light- and he dreams. In this state the person becomes self-illuminated.

http://www.bharatadesam.com/spiritual/upanishads/brihadaranyaka_upanishad_2.php

Also according to Swami Krishnananda it's about svapna experienced in the material world, not the original state of jiva.

M:

tad yatha maha matsya ubhe kule' nusancarati purvam ca param caivam evayam purusa etav ubhav antav anusancarati svapnantam ca buddhantam ca

"Just as a large fish living in the river wanders from one bank to the other, so the jiva is of similar quality, and is equipped to wander in the Karana waters between the material and spiritual worlds (svapnanta and buddhanta)."
(Brhadaranyaka Upanisad 4.3.18)

Here Bhaktivinoda follows Vedic sastra.

J:

Karanodaka is already conditioned state.

M:

Preaching strategy acc to Vyasa:

Childish foolish people are attached to materialistic, fruitive activities. Therefore the Vedic injunctions indirectly lead one to the path of ultimate liberation by first prescribing fruitive religious activities, just as a father promises his child candy so that the child will take the medicine. (Bhag. 11.3.44, text)

Jiva Goswami svakiya parakiya issue: In the *Locana Rocini Tika* on *Ujjvala Nilamani* 1.18, he writes:

Some things I have written here by my own will, and some due to the will of others. The part which is coherent is by my will, and the rest is due to others.

J:

If svakiya was incoherent, then also the sastras which describe it. Can it be supported by evidence?

Svakiya has its role in the bhauma lila.

M:

Srila Prabhupada has also stated:

Krsna's service is so sublime that even if we cheat, you are not culprit. But because we have to deal with the worldly man, we have to go according to their rules and regulations on cheating. Otherwise, a devotee of Krsna, he never cheats. He never cheats. Whatever he does... Just like a mother says to his child, "My dear child, if you take this medicine, I will give you this lugloo." The child is diseased. He will not be able to digest lugloo, but the mother sometimes cheats him. And when he takes the medicine the lugloo is not delivered. Similarly, sometimes we have to say so many things very pleasing to him, but our business is that let him take this medicine. That is tactics. But that is not cheating. If the mother helps the child in drinking medicine and then afterwards she does not supply the lugloo, that is not cheating. Some way or other... That is the instruction of Rupa Gosvami, *yena tena prakarena manah krsne nivesayet:* "Somehow or other, let everyone be Krsna conscious." There is no question of *vidhi-nisedha.* Sarve *vidhi-nisedha syur etayor eva kinkarah.* The other rules and regulation will act as servant, but the main business is to bring one to Krsna consciousness. That is the main business. We are not meant for cheating anyone. We have no business. But to lead one to Krsna consciousness we may say something sometimes. So that is not cheating. (SP Room Conv. Atlanta, March 2, 1975)

Pusta Krsna: Sometimes it may be required to interest someone in a book, that they may find out their interest. Just like people are interested in philanthropic activity.

Prabhupada: Just like our... What is his name?

Hari-sauri: Tripurari? (laughter)

Prabhupada: Some lady inquired, "Is there any instruction about the power shortage?" "Oh, yes." (laughs) So she purchased, and the next day she said, "There is nothing about power." So suppose Tripurari has sold one book. The lady inquired, "Is there any basic instruction about power shortage?" And he said, "Yes." So you think it is wrong. That is your version... Another example is that Yudhisthira Maharaja. He was asked by Krsna that "You speak lie to Dronacarya that 'Your son is dead.'" Yudhisthira Maharaja refused. For this he had to see hell. He was more moralist than Krsna. For this moral activity he had to visit hell.

These are the secrets of the acaryas. Sometimes they conceal the real purpose of the Vedas, and explain the Vedas in a different way. Sometimes they enunciate a different theory just to bring the atheists under their control. (Cc. Madhya-lila 25.42, purp.)

J:

Now it should be just supported by evidence that this „concealing the real purpose“ was the case here.

----- end -----

PS: Here are some other relevant quotes:

BG 5.15 with commentary by VCT: the original state of jiva is pure

nAdatte kasyacit pApaM na caiva sukRtaM vibhuH
ajJAnenAvRtaM jJAnaM tena muhyanti jantavaH

Thus, the Lord does not receive the sinful or pious reaction from those actions. The jIva's knowledge is covered by ignorance. Because of this, living entities are bewildered.

yasmAd asAdhu-sAdhu-karmANAm Izvaro na kArayitA, na tasmAd eva na tasya pApa-pUNya-bhAgitvam ity Aha, nAdatte na gRhNAti; kintu tadIyA khalu yA zaktir avidyA, saiva jIva-jJAnam AvRNotIty Aha, ajJAnenAvidyayA. jJAnaM jIvasya svAbhAvikaM, tena hetunA.

(translation Bhanu Swami:) Since the Lord does not make the jIva do either good or bad actions, he does not experience the results in the form of suffering or enjoyment. He does not accept (na adatte) them. (He is not responsible for them). However, one of His associates, **His zakti called ignorance (ajJAnena) covers the inherent knowledge of the jIva**. Because of this (tena), the jIvas are bewildered (and hence act and suffer or enjoy their karma).

SB 5.13.1

duratyaye 'dhvany ajayA nivezito

duratyaye-which is very difficult to traverse; adhvani-on the path of fruitive activities (performing actions in this life, creating a body in the next life by those actions, and in this way continuously accepting birth and death); ajayA-by mAyA, the external energy of the Supreme Personality of Godhead; nivezitaH-caused to enter

5.14.1

samsara-atavyam-in the forest of material life; gatah-having entered;

Gatah in Sanskrit indicates transition to, attainment of, achievement of, having gone to, having entered. Tense is Past Perfect Participle.

VCT: In the Fourteenth Chapter the characters of the story like the plunderers and the jackals are explained to be the six senses and one's family members. The jiva going into the forest of samsara, even today has not attained the devotees, who, like bees, are attracted to the worship of the lotus feet of guru, a form of the Lord. (...)

another translation:

Just as a caravan of merchant, intent on making money, loses its way to find itself in a wilderness, this company of jivas (individual souls) has been set on this difficult path (of samsara), hard to travel like a mountain pass, by Maya (the deluding potency of the Lord) which functions under the Supreme Ruler Visnu. It (the multitude of jivas) finds itself in the wilderness of samsara, in-auspicious-most like a funeral ground. (...) (The Bhagavata Purana, Part II, Motilal Banarsidass, 1950 etc., p. 700 / pdf 286)

Lord Caitanya's Siksastaka:

ayi nanda-tanuja kinkaram
patitam mam visame bhavambudhau
krpaya tava pada-pankaja
sthita-dhuli-sadrsam vicintaya

Srila Prabhupada translates 'patitam mam visame bhavambudhau' as "somehow or other I have fallen into the ocean of birth and death". Here Lord Caitanya plays the role of an ordinary conditioned soul (as BVT states in his commentary to this verse, and as Lord Caitanya proves in the second verse of Siksastaka).

BVT's Sanmodana Bhasya to Siksastaka 5:

Lord Krsna, the son of Maharaja Nanda, is the object of everyone's devotion. Servitorship to Lord Krsna is inseparable from the identity or svarupa of the spirit soul.

Now that servant of Krsna has become apathetic to his service and is drowning in the terrible ocean of material existence, his only hope of survival is to get the Lord's mercy. If Lord Krsna out of His fathomless compassion accepts the jiva, placing him as a pollen particle at His lotus feet, then his hidden identity and eternal proclivity will be remanifest. The word pada-dhuli (lotus-feet dust) used

here further substantiates the jiva's original identity as the infinitesimal part and parcel of Krsna, as stated in the scriptures.

Sanatana Gosvami's Brhad-Bhagavatamrta (2.6.76):

ciradrsta-prana-priya-sakham ivavapya sa tu mam
kare dhrtva vama-sva-kara-kamalena prabhu-varah
vicitram samprasnam vidadhad akhilams tan vraja-janan
samanandya sriman avisad ibha-gami vraja-varam

cira - for a long time; adrsta - not seen; prana - life; priya - dear; sakham - friend; iva - as if; avapya - attaining; sah - He; tu - indeed; mam - me; kare - by the hand; dhrtva - taking; vama-sva-kara-kamalena - in His own left lotus hand; prabhu-varah - the Lord; vicitram - wonderful; samprasnam - question; vidadhat - placing; akhilam - all; tan - them; vraja - of Vraja; janam - the people; samanandya - delighting; sriman - handsome; avisat - entered; ibha - as an elephant; gami - walking; vraja-varam - to Vraja.

(translation Kusakratha das:) "Having attained me, **a friend more dear than life, as if He had not seen me for a long time**, taking my hand in His left lotus hand, asking me wonderful questions, bringing happiness to all the people of Vraja, and walking as gracefully as an elephant, the handsome Lord entered the village of Vraja."

(translation Gopiparanadhana das:) Taking my hand in His own left lotus hand, He received me **as a long-lost bosom friend**. That best of Lords asked me various questions and then, greeting all the people of Vraja, entered the best of cowherd villages with the gait of an elephant. (BBh 2.2, p. 326, BBT edition)

Originally Sarupa, aka Gopa Kumara, was in the spiritual world with Krsna, but then he left His company for a long time ("cirAdRSTa: long time unseen / lost"), and now he is back there again.

CC 2.20.117

kRSNa bhuli' sei jIva anAdi-bahirmukha
ataeva mAyA tAre deya saMsAra-duHkha

kRSNa bhuli'—forgetting KRSNa; sei jIva—that living entity; anAdi—from time immemorial; bahir-mukha—attracted by the external feature; ataeva—therefore; mAyA—illusory energy; tAre—to him; deya—gives; saMsAra-duHkha—miseries of material existence.

“Forgetting KRSNa, the living entity has been attracted by the external feature from time immemorial. Therefore the illusory energy [mAyA] gives him all kinds of misery in his material existence.

CC 2.22.24

’kRSNa-nitya-dAsa’—jIva tAhA bhuli’ gela
ei doSe mAyA tAra galAya bAndhila

kRSNa-nitya-dAsa—eternal servant of KRSNa; jIva—the living entity; tAhA—that; bhuli’—forgetting; gela—went; ei doSe—for this fault; mAyA—the material energy; tAra—his; galAya—on the neck; bAndhila—has bound.

“The living entity is bound around the neck by the chain of mAyA because he has forgotten that he is eternally a servant of KRSNa.

BVT, Saranagati, First Principle of Surrender, Dainya Humility, song 1:

bhuliya tomare, samsare asiya
peye nana-bidha byatha
tomara carane, asiyachi ami
bolibo dukhera katha

bhuliya--forgetting; tomare--You; samsare--in the material world; asiya--going; peye--I experience; nana-bidha--different kinds; byatha--sufferings; tomara--of You; carane--at the feet; asiyachi--I went; ami--I; boliba--I will say; dukhera--of sufferings; katha--the description.

"My dear Lord, I have come to the material world by forgetting You. Since I have come here I have suffered many troubles for a long time through many different species of life. Therefore I have come to surrender unto You and submit unto You the story of my suffering."

another translation:

O Lord, I forgot You and came to this material world, where I have experienced a host of pains and sorrows. Now I approach Your lotus feet and submit my tale of woe.

BVT, Kalyana Kalpataru 1.3.1:

mana re, tumi bada sandigdha-antar
asiyacho e samsare, baddha ho'ye jadadhare,
jadasakta ho'le nirantar

My dear mind, you are most suspicious and doubtful at heart. Having come into this material world, and becoming conditioned within the prison cell of this dull material body, you have become stupefied by being attached continuously to temporary external matter.

Kalyana-kalpitaru 2.3, song 1:

(21)

sei maya adarser samasta bisesa
loiya gathilo bisva jahe purna klesa

This illusory energy maya, has created the material universe exactly like an imitation model of the real spiritual variegatedness, but with the added feature of being full of various miseries.

(22)

jiba jadi hoilena krsna-bahimukha
mayadevi tabe ta'r jachilena sukha

If by chance a living entity becomes averse to the Supreme Lord Krsna, then Mayadevi's duty is to voluntarily offer her temptations of material happiness.

(23)

maya-sukhe matta jiba sri-krsna bhulilo
sei se avidya-base asmita janmilo

Intoxicated by maya's illusory happiness, the living entity then forgets Krsna. Under the influence of such ignorance, false egoistic selfishness arises.

BVT, AruNodaya-kIrtana II

(2) bhajibo boliyA ese saMsAra-bhitare
bhuliyA rohile tumi avidyAra bhare

You came into this world saying, 'O my Lord, I will certainly worship You,' but having forgotten this promise, you have remained in great ignorance.

BVT, Emana Durmati 1:

emona durmati, saMsAra bhitore,
poDiyA Achinu Ami
tava nija-jana, kono mahAjane,
pAThAiyA dile tumi

O Lord! With such a wicked mind as this I have fallen into the material world, but You have sent one of Your pure and elevated devotees to rescue me.

BVT, BAul SaGgIt, Song 12:

(1)
ho'ye viSaye Aveza, pe'le, mana, jAtanA azeSa
chADi' rAdhA-zyAme braja-dhAme,
bhugcho hethA nAnA-kleza

"My dear mind, you have brought unending trouble upon yourself under the sway of material sense gratification. **Leaving the company of Radha-Syama in Vraja-dhama, you have come to this material world and suffered a host of painful miseries.**"

Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati:

"It is the jivas who are attendants in His [Krishna's] Sports. They become attached to matter having deviated from their own essential nature as the result of their desire for enjoyment. But when again the soul of a jiva gains true wisdom of the transcendental region of God..., he begins to get back his pure essential nature gradually." (Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 323)

"Sri Radhika is the Source of all individual souls whose function is to be employed in the service of Sri Krishna by the alternative methods [of] loyal conscious submission, neutrality or actual opposition. The individual souls serve Sri Krishna as constituents of Sri Radhika. When they forget that they are constituents of Sri Radhika they forget the nature of their own selves, and engage in the abnormal activities of the mundane world." (Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 496)

ACBSP:

That is quite reasonable, that every living entity or soul is part and parcel of God, but on account of some sinful activities or disobedience to God, as they believe Adam on account of disobedience to God they lost Paradise and came to this material world, similarly, the soul belongs to the Paradise, or heaven, or Krsna, but somehow or other he falls down within this material world, and he

gets first a body like Adam. (SP Discussions with Hayagriva Dasa, St. Augustine)

Appendix 1

Fall Verses – Patanam Slokas

BY: BAHUSHIRA DASA (ACBSP)

Mar 16, USA (SUN) — For the benefit of the devotees some verses are being given that are about the jivas patanam – falldown into the material realm. The first verse is from Skanda Purana 4.95.37. It is stated therein that if one breaks Ekadasi one can fall from Vaikuntha. In the Brahma Vaivarta Purana, Krsna Janma Khanda, Ch. 111, Verse 4 and 5, Radha is speaking to Mother Yashoda:

Kim vaaham kathayisyaami Jnaanam pancavidhesu ca
Bhaktaatmakam sarvaparam nibodha kathayaami te

kim-what;va-aham-or,I; katha-yisyaami-shall say; jnaanam-knowledge; panchavidhesu-of five kinds or types; ca-and; bhaktyaatmakam-devotional knowledge; sarvaparam-best of all; nibodha-learn;kathayaami-I tell; te-to you;

Of the five types of knowledge what shall I say to you? I speak the best of all devotional knowledge please listen.

Srii Krsnasya varenaapi na saadho nirbhayo bhava Goloke caapi patanam
sambhavecca kuyoginah

Srii Krsnasya-of Srii Krsna;verena-by the boon; api-also; na-not; saadho-good lady; nirbhayah-fearless;bhava-become; Goloke-in Goloka; ca-api-and also; patanam-falldown; sambhavet-is liable,possible; ca-and; kuyoginah-imperfect yogi,or bad ascetic

Oh good lady do not become fearless by the boon of Sree Krsna,an imperfect yogi(bad ascetic)can also possibly fall from Goloka.

Also in Krsna Janma Khanda, Ch. 126, Verse 59, Srii Radha is speaking to Sree Krsna:

Atyucchrito nipatanam prapnotyeva dhruvam prabho Aaraad vipatti bijam ca
vaisnavanam vihimsanam

Atiucchritah-highly elevated,from a very high place; nipatanam-falldown,fall;
prapnoti-attains; eva-certainly; druvam-for sure,surely;prabho-oh lord; aaraad-
near, soon; vipatti-bijam-cause of distress, misfortune; ca-and; vaisnavaanaam-
of the vaisnavas; vihimsanam-hurting, injuring, torturing

Oh Lord, after reaching extreme height, one certainly falls. The violence of the
Vaisnavas results in misfortune.

In the Brahma Vaivarta Purana, Prakriti Khanda, Ch. 27, verse 59, Yamaraja is
speaking to Savitri (Mother of the Vedas)

Ghritapradiipam Haraye Kaartike yo dadaatica Palapramaanam varsam ca
modate Harimandire

Ghrita-pradiipam-ghee lamp;Haraye-to the Lord;Kaartike-in the month of
Kaartika; Yah-whoever; dadaati-offers; ca-and; palapramaanam-equivalent to the
number of seconds; varsam-years; ca-and; modate-enjoys; Hari mandire-in the
abode of Hari

Whoever in the month of Kaartika offers a lamp of ghee to Hari enjoys in
Vaikuntha (Hari Mandira) for as many years equivalent to the number of
seconds (palas-a pala is 24 seconds) for which the lamp is burnt.

Verse 60:

Punah svayonim sampraapya Vishnubhaktim labhed dhruvam Mahaa
dhanaadhyah sa bhavec Chaksusmaanshcaiva diiptimaan

Punah-again;sva-yonim-human birth;samprapya-having got; Vishnubhaktim-
devotion of the Lord; labhed-dhruvam-will get certainly;mahaadhanaadhyah-
immensely rich;sah-he; bhavet-may become;sah-he; bhavet-may become;
chaksusmaan-ca-eva-endowed with vision-and-also;diiptimaan-full of glory

Verse 60: Born again, he certainly attains Vishnubhakti. He becomes immensely
rich, endowed with clear vision and glory.

Chapter 27, verse 74:

Karoti Bhaarate yo hi Krsnajanmaastami vratam Sata janma krtaat paapaan
mucyate naatra samshayah

Karoti-observes,does; Bhaarate-in the land of Bhaarat;yah-whoever; hi-
certainly,indeed; Krsna Janmaatamii Vratam-vrata on the eighth day of Krsna's

birth; Shata janma krtaat-committed in a hundred births;paapaat-from the sin;mucyate-is released,relieved; na-not; atra-in this; samshayah-doubt;

He who performs the vrata of Krsna Janmaastamii, is relieved of the sins of hundreds of births. There is no doubt about it.

Verse 75:

Vaikunthe modate so'pi yava dindraas caturdasa Punah svayonim samprapya Krsnabhaktim labhed dhruvam

Vaikunthe-in Vaikuntha; modate-enjoys; sah-he; api-also; yaavat-as long as; Indraah-Indraas; caturdasa-fourteen; punah-again; sva-yonim-human birth; sampraapya-having got; Krsna bhaktim-devotion to Krsna; labhet-gets; dhruvam-certainly

He enjoys in Vaikuntha for the reign of fourteen Indras and taking birth again, attains Krsna bhakti for certain.

Verse 81:

Sri Raamanavamim yo hi karoti Bhaarate narah Sapta manvantaram yaavan modate Vishnu mandire

Sri Rama Navami-Rama Navami; yah-whoever; hi-certainly, surely; karoti-celebrates; Bhaarate-in the land of Bhaarat; Narah-human, man; Sapta-manvantaram-seven manvantaras; yaavat-as long as; modate-enjoys; Vishnu mandire-in Vishnuloka

Whoever celebrates Rama Navami in Bharat enjoys in Vaikuntha for seven Manvantaras.

Verse 82:

Punah svayonim sampraapya Raamabhaktim labhed dhruvam Jitendriyaanaam pravaro mahamsca dhaarmiko bhavet

Punah-again; svayonim-human body; sampraapya-having attained; Raamabhaktim-devotion to Lord Rama; labhet-gets; dhruvam-surely; jitendriyaanaam-among those that are self disciplined; pravarah-the best; mahan-great; ca-and; dhaarmikah-religious; bhavet-becomes

He then takes birth again and obtains devotion to Rama for certain; he then becomes the best of those who control their senses and a great follower of dharma.

Verse 90:

Kaartike purnimaayaam ca krtvaa tu raasamandalam Gopaanaam shatakam
krtvaa gopiinaam shatakam tathaa

Verse 91:

Shilaayaam pratimaayaam vaa SriiKrsnam Raadhaayaa saha Bhaarate puujayed
dattvaa copacaaraani sodasha

Verse 92:

Bhaaratam punaraagatya Haribhaktim labhed dhruvam Goloke ca vaset so'pi
yaavad vai brahmano vayah

Verse 93:

Kramena sudrdhaam bhaktim labhvaa mantram Harerapi Deham tyaktvaa ca
golokam punareva prayaati sah

Verse 94:

Taatra Krsnasya saaruupyam paarsado bhavet Punastatpatanam naasti
jaraamrtyuharo mahaan

Kartike-in the month of Kartika; purnimayam-on the full moon day; ca-and;
krtva-having gone; rasamandalam-the place for the rasa dance; gopanam-
cowherd men; shatakam-a hundred; krtva-having dressed; gopinam-cowherd
girls; shaktakam-a hundred; tatha-and; shilayam-of stone; pratimayam-form; va-
or; Sri Krsnanam-Sri Krsna; Radhaya-Radha; saha-with; Bharate-in India;
pujayed-worships; dattva-offering; ca-upacarani-types of offerings; sodasa-
sixteen; Goloke-in Goloka; ca-and; vaset-lives; sah-he; api-also; yavat-as long
as; vai-indeed; brahmanah-of Brahma; yavah-life span; Bharatam-India; punah-
again; agatya-being born; Haribhaktim-devotion to Hari; labhet-gets; dhruvam-
sure; kramena-gradually; sudrdham-intense; bhaktim-devotion; labdhva-having
received; mantram-mantra; Hareh-of Hari; api-and; deham-body; tyaktva-giving
up; ca-and; Golokam-Goloka; punah-again; eva-surely; prayati-goes; sah-he;
tatra-there; Krsnasya-of Krsna; sarupyam-form similar to; samprapya-having
acquired; parsadah-associate; bhavet-becomes; punah-again; tatpatanam-his

fall-down; na-not; asti-there is; jara-mrtyu-harah-free from old age and death;
mahan-great

He who makes a Rasamandala on the full moon of Kartika, and makes forms of a hundred Gopas, a hundred Gopis, and worships Krsna along with Radha in a stone form and worshipping Him with a sixteen items, will live in Goloka for the life span of Brahma.

Returning to Bharata he will certainly attain bhakti to the Lord and His mantras. Quitting his body and returning to Goloka he attains the form of Hari and becomes one of His attendants free from birth and death. He never falls again.

Chapter 27, Verse 95:

Shuklaam vaapyathavaa Krsnaam karotyekaadasiim ca yah Vaikunthe modate
so'pi yaavadvai brahmano vayah

Shuklam-bright; va-api-athava-or too or; Krsnam-dark fortnight; karoti-
observes; Ekadashi vrata (eleventh day); ca-and; yah-he who, whoever;
Vaikunthe-in Vaikuntha; modate-enjoys; sah-api-he, to; yavad-vai-till-certainly;
brahmanah-of Brahma; vayah-life age-life span;

Whoever observes Ekadashi in either phase of the moon enjoys in Vaikuntha for the life span of Brahma.

Verse 96:

Bhaaratam punaraagatya Haribhaktim labhed dhruvam Punaryaati ca
vaikuntham na tasya patanam bhavet

Bharatam-to the land of Bharata; punaragatya-again coming back; Haribhaktim-
devotion to Lord Hari; labhet-will get; dhruvam-certainly; punar yati-again
goes; ca-and; Vaikuntham-Vaikuntha; na-not; tasya-his; patanam-fall; bhavet-
will be, occurs

Coming back to Bharata he will certainly attain bhakti to the Lord. He will again go to Vaikuntha and not fall (He reverts to Vaikuntha and never falls again-na tasya patanam bhavet).

Chapter 26 Verse 109:

Yo vakti vaa dadaatyeva Harernaamaani Bhaarate Yugam naamapramaanam ca
Vishnuloke mahiiyate

Yah-he who; vakti-speaks or recites; va-or; dadati-gives; eva-indeed,just; Hareh-of Hari; namani-the names; Bharate-in the land of Bharat; yugam-a yuga; namapramanam-names equivalent to the number of; ca-and; Vishnuloke-in the Vishnuloka; mahiyate-is respected or adored

He who recites the name of Vishnu or gives it to someone in Bharat, enjoys in Vaikuntha (Vishnuloka) for as many Yugas as names he has recited.

Chapter 26 Verse 110:

Tatah punarihaagatya Vishnubhaktim labhed dhruvam Yadi Naaraayanaksetre phalam kotigunam labhet

Tatah-thereafter; punar-iha-agatya-again here having come; Vishnubhaktim-devotion to Vishnu; labhet-will attain, get; dhruvam-certainly, surely; yadi-if; Narayana-ksetre-in Narayana region; phalam-merit; results; kotigunam-ten million times; labhet-will attain

Returning to Earth he attains bhakti to Vishnu for certain. If he does this in a place of Narayana he obtains ten million times the merit (result).

The Sanskrit words that are used in these verses of Brahma Vaivarta Purana makes it very clear what is being said about the Jivas actually falling from Vaikuntha, Goloka and then taking birth on Earth. Finally they return to Goloka or Vaikuntha leaving Earth behind.

Select portions of the verses are given so the reader can get a bird's eye view of the repetitive phrases that drive the points home so clearly:

Krsna Janma Khanda, ch. 111, verse 5: patanam-falls, falldown

Krsna Janma Khanda, ch. 126, verse 59:Ati ucchrtah nipatanam-from a very high place falling down

Prakriti Khanda, ch. 27, verse 60: Punah svayonim-again human birth

Prakriti Khanda, ch. 27, verse 75: Punah svayonim-again human birth

Prakriti Khanda, ch. 27, verse 82: Punah svayonim-again human birth

Note: These verses are relating to taking birth again after going to Vaikuntha.

Prakriti Khanda, ch. 27, Verse 92: Punah agatya-again coming back

Prakriti Khanda, ch. 27, Verse 93: Goloka punar eva prayat sah-He surely goes to Goloka again.

Prakriti Khanda, ch. 27, Verse 94: Punas tat patanam nasti-He never falls again (note: this is after having come back to Earth from Goloka and then going back there.)

Prakriti Khanda, ch. 27, verse 96: Bharatam punaragatya-again coming back to Bharata.

Punaryati ca Vaikuntham na tasya patanam bhavet-He will again go to Vaikuntha and not fall.

Prakriti Khanda, ch. 27, verse 110: Tatah punarihagatya-thereafter again having come here (from Vaikuntha)

In chapter 111, verse 5, the word patanam meaning fall or falldown is used. The question may be asked who falls down? The kuyogi, imperfect yogi, the bad ascetic, the one who has left devotional service. And who are they? They are the jivas who misuse their freewill. That is why the word sambhavet is used. It means liable or possible. Because some jivas don't misuse their freewill. Those who misuse their freewill fall to the material world and they are therefore imperfect. Bhaktivinode Thakura describes in Jaiva Dharma in Nitya Dharma, part 5: "The imprisonment of the jiva began when the jiva forgot his position as the eternal servant of Sri Krsna. This forgetfulness is the original offence of the jiva and is the root of all the jiva's subsequent offences." In Srimad Bhagavatam purport of 3.26.7 Srila Prabhupada states: "Whatever the material energy dictates, the conditioned soul does. He has no responsibility. He is simply the witness of the actions. But he is forced to act that way due to his offence in his eternal relationship with Krsna." And what is that original offence? Giving up the Lord's service. In Srimad Bhagavatam 5.14.1 Prabhupada states in the purport: "When the pure soul wants to give up the Lord's service to enjoy the material world, Krsna certainly gives him a chance to enter the material world." In Tokyo on April 20, 1972 Prabhupada stated: "He has fallen means he has given up the service of Krsna." Giving up the service to Sri Krsna is due to freewill which leads to more forgetfulness. There are other aspects of freewill, but giving up service means giving up our love to Krsna, or we want to serve in another way that is not compatible in the spiritual world. Krsna does not force you to love Him. You have to desire it willingly and that is the topmost use of freewill. The other angle is that by misusing our freewill we make the wrong decision and we are immediately covered by Maya. Freewill is perfect and

imperfect and yes it is an inconceivable truth (Acintya Tattva) It is perfect in the aspect of allowing one to freely choose to serve and it is imperfect when we choose to ignore Krsna. The perfect aspect of this imperfection of the jiva is that you can go back to serve Krsna again. Srimad Bhagavatam 6.11.25 confirms this:

Aham Hare tava paadaika-muula daasaanudaaso bhavitaasmi bhuuyah Manah smaretaasu-pater gunaams te grniita vaak karma karotu kaayah

“Oh my Lord, O Supreme Personality of Godhead, will I again be able to be a servant of Your eternal servants who find shelter at Your lotus feet? Oh Lord of my life, may I again become their servant so that my mind may always engage in the loving service of Your Lordship.”

Twice Srila Prabhupada uses the word bhuyah (again), stressing the point. When the jivas misuse freewill in Goloka, Vaikuntha it is not like a case of newly transformed envious jivas hanging around. They are instantly covered and ousted from the Lord’s realm. Bhaktisiddhanta Thakura’s purport to text 44 of Brahma Samhita states: “When he forgets his service of Krsna he is at once deflected by the attracting power of Maya in this world.” On a morning walk in Vrndavana 9–13-75 Prabhupada said: “He has given you little freedom’ you can use it. Yathecchasi tathaa kuru, Krsna says in Gita (18.63), ‘Whatever you like you do.’”

Some devotees seem to think that this discussion of the “Fall, no Fall of the Jiva” started after Prabhupada’s disappearance but that is not a fact. In the early 1970’s Madhudvisha had to deal with the issue in Australia and the Crow and Tal Fruit Logic letter is a result of that exchange. The letter has typed parts and Prabhupada also added his own handwritten notes and he signed the letter by hand. Madhudvisha has the letter. In the early 1970’s Siddhasvarupananda Swami was preaching that the jivas came from the Brahmajyoti and Srila Prabhupada told him not to preach that in his temples. In a letter to Caturbhuj Dasa, L. A., 5–9-73, Prabhupada wrote him: “Your last question ‘How is the soul degraded (by lust, anger and greed) when it is transcendental to the body? Doesn’t that imply that the soul has changed? ‘No. The soul never changes, but due to his tinyness he may become forgetful of his relationship with Krsna. The spiritual quality of the spiritual spark has not changed but he has forgotten his spiritual nature, bewildered by the imperfect desire to become equal or greater than Krsna.’

Most of the verses from Brahma Vaivarta Purana are showing how a jiva can go to Vaikuntha or Goloka but unless one’s devotion is FULLY developed he will fall back to this material world due to lack of chit (knowledge) strength. But

eventually he will go and stay permanently in Vaikuntha/Goloka. Those verses in shastra that state that one does not fall from Vaikuntha are referring either to jivas who fell originally and are now reinstated, and generally won't fall again or to those jivas who never fell to begin with. Bhaktisiddhanta Thakur clarifies the point in Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 101 "The position of the jiva is a part of the tatastha-sakti that can enjoy, cease to enjoy, and go back to his original position". And Srila Prabhupada says in a similar vein on a morning walk:

Paramahansa: So we can come to the spiritual world and return?

Prabhupada: Yes.

Paramahansa: Falldown?

Prabhupada: Yes.... He goes out of his free will; again comes out, again goes. Like that.

(Cheviot Hills Golf Course-5-13-73, L. A.)

Srila Prabhupada stressed the verse: Mahaajano yena gatah sa panthaa-one must follow in the footsteps of the Mahajanas (Mahabhaarata, Vana Parva, 313.117). And who is speaking these verses from Brahma Vaivarta Purana? They happen to be Mahajanas. Narayana Rsi is talking to Narada Rsi about what Yamaraj spoke to Savitri (MOTHER OF THE VEDAS). Brahma also joins in later. So their statements carry weight. So for our Brahma-Vadi friends (no fall fellows) what will they do now? Maybe demonize these verses as Apa siddhantic or of the Kuyogi Sampradaya? Or belittle the slokas as simply words to encourage the pious to do Punyas? Or try to emphasize that these verses are fanciful imagination? Then better yet they may try to minimize these verses as secondary evidence or not authentic or as interpolations? Any way you want to cut it, there is disagreement on this point and the Patanam Slokas stand their ground and they support Srila Prabhupada that jivas can fall (patanam) from Vaikuntha/Goloka. So how can apparently contradictory statements be reconciled? Jiva Goswami explains in his Krsna Sandarbha 152.9 that Vedanta Sutra states "If there are two contradictory statements in scripture, the first statement should be interpreted so that it does not contradict the later statement." So the way to employ this understanding of Jiva Goswami means that for us, the Fallvadis (as the Brahmavadis call us) we accept both ideas i. e. coming from Brahman and coming from Vaikuntha/Goloka. The jivas coming from Brahman are those jivas who did not get liberated in Brahma's lifetime and entered the body of Mahavisnu. So when they reappear when Mahavishnu begins to expand universes again that occurrence is an origin because it is over a time period of trillions and trillions of years which is like eternity. That origin is what the Upanishads describe. And we accept the understanding that the jivas that have left their service in Vaikuntha/Goloka, due to free will, come here to the material world. In all of this discussion one important point to understand is that to Krsna, in Krsna's transcendental time, or reckoning, we are here in this material

world for one or two seconds. How is this? Again in Brahma Vaivarta Purana, Krsna Janma Khanda, ch. 25, verse 101 it is stated that “Brahma dies when Krsna winks”. So if a jiva stays in a universe for the life of Lord Brahma, which is trillions of years, and then goes back to Goloka, then in Goloka, it is one second. So in real Transcendental Time we are here for a very, very short time. And to put the icing on the cake we will let Srila Prabhupada have the last word on the topic quoting Srimad Bhagavatam. According to Jiva Goswami in the Tattva Sandarbha the Srimad Bhagavatam is the highest sastra and the most perfect of all evidence. So let's hear the verse as a pure devotee understands it. In Bhagavad Gita 6.47 Srila Prabhupada states in the purport: “Every living entity is of the Supreme Personality of Godhead, and thus every living entity is intended to serve the Supreme Lord by his own constitution. Failing to do this, he falls down. The Bhagavatam (11.5.3) confirms this as follows:

Ya esaam purusam saaksaad aatma prabhavam ishvaram Nabhajaty avajaananti
sthaanaad bhrastah patanty adhah

Anyone who does not render service and neglects his duty unto the primeval lord, who is the source of all living entities will certainly fall down from his constitutional position.”

A Bhagavad-gita lecture that was given on 2-21-69, in L. A. (Collected Lectures on Bhagavad-gita As It Is, Vol.5, pp. 6–7), Prabhupada quotes the same Bhagavatam verse 11.5.3. He then gives this commentary which throws even more light on it making it clearer: “His is also a very nice example. The Bhagavat says that we are all parts and parcels of the Supreme. If we do not serve the Supreme, then we fall down from our specified place. What is that?.... If the part and parcel cannot render service regularly, that means it is painful. So any person who is not rendering service to the Supreme Lord, he's simply giving pain to the Supreme Lord. He's simply giving trouble. Therefore he has to suffer.... The same example. Sthanad bhrastah patanty adhah. And as soon as one thing is very painful, just like the government keeps all these painful citizens into a prison house. Collect together. ‘You live here, you are nonsense, you criminals live here. Don't live in the open state.’ Similarly, all these criminals who have violated the laws of God, who have simply given pain to the Lord, they are put in this material world. And, sthanad bhrastah, he falls down from the specified place.... So we have fallen down. Being against the principles of God consciousness, we are fallen down. So if we want to revive our original position, we must be placed again in that service attitude.... The best thing is to revive our original Krsna consciousness and be engaged in the service of the Lord. That is the natural life and that is possible in the spiritual sky or the Goloka Vrndavana.”

At the end of the lecture a question was asked: “Why are you teaching about Krsna Consciousness? Prabhupada answered ‘Because you have forgotten the service of Radha and Krsna, therefore you have become the servant of Maya.’”

So in conclusion the Mahajanas have talked about agatya patanam, falling from Vaikuntha/Goloka. Vyasadeva, who compiled the Puranas, has presented slokas about patanam (falldown), so has Bhaktivinode Thakura and Bhaktisiddhanta Thakura mentioned fall and no fall of the jiva. Srila Prabhupada has quoted Srimad Bhagavatam to stress the point about freewill causing the jiva to fall, so one cannot say that ISKCON devotees are the only ones who have spoken of the fall of the jiva from Vaikuntha and Goloka.

Note: English translations by Bhanu Swami
Word for Word by Dr. Santosh Kumari (Sanskrit Gold Medalist) and Dr. Sudershan Kaushik (Sanskrit Gold Medalist)

Appendix 2

Aparadha quotes

- Krsna lila

AvirbhUyAdbhutAM krIDAM vRndAranye kariSyati
vRSabhAnu sutA rAdhA zrIdAmAnaM hareH priyam 27
sakhayaM virajA gehad vAH sthaM kruddhA zapiSyati
tataH so 'pi mahAbhAga rAdhAM prati zapiSyati 28
yAhi tvaM mAnuSaM lokaM mithaH zApAd dharAM tataH
prApsyaty atha hariH pazcAd brahmaNA prArthitaH kSitau 29
bhU bhARa haraNA yaiva vAsudevA bhaviSyati
vasudeva gRhe janma prApya yAdava nandanaH 30

O Mahesana, He makes gopas and gopis happy, o Siva. At one point He will appear on earth in the region of Mathura and will display wonderful lila in Vrndavana. Radha, the daughter of Vrsabhanu, will angrily curse Sridama, the dear friend of Hari, standing at guard at the threshold of Viraja's place, and he will in turn curse Radha, o greatly fortunate one. "Go down to the mortal world." Due to this mutual curse, and on later request by Brahma, Hari will come to earth to remove her burden. He will be born in the house of Vasudeva and will be called VAsudeva and Yadava-nandana. (Narada Purana 2.81.27-30)

This pastime also appears in Brahma-vaivarta Purana (4.2–3) and Garga-samhita (2.26).

- Caitanya lila

zizu vatsa hari' brahmA kari aparAdha
aparAdha kSamAite mAgena prasAda
pitA mAtA bAlakera nA laya aparAdha
aparAdha kSama, more karaha prasAda

After BrahmA had offended KRSTNa by stealing His playmates and calves, he begged the Lord's pardon for his offensive act and prayed for the Lord's mercy. "Parents never take seriously the offenses of their children. I therefore beg Your pardon and ask for Your benediction." CC 1.2.31,33 [Brahma]

aparAdha kSamAila, Dubila prema-jale
kebA eDAibe prabhura prema-mahAjAle

Lord Caitanya excused them all, and they merged into the ocean of devotional service, for no one can escape the unique loving network of zrI Caitanya MahAprabhu. CC 1.7.37 [students etc.]

vedamaya-mUrta tumi,—sAkSAt nArAyaNa
kSama aparAdha,—pUrve ye kailuG nindana
ei-mate tAG-sabAra kSami' aparAdha
sabAkAre kRSNa-nAma karilA prasAda

"Dear Sir, You are Vedic knowledge personified and are directly NArAyaNa Himself. Kindly excuse us for the offenses we previously committed by criticizing You."

Thus Lord Caitanya excused all the offenses of the MAyAvAdI sannyAsIs and very mercifully blessed them with kRSNa-nAma. CC 1.7.148,150 [Mayavadi sannyasis]

AmAreha kabhu yei nA haya prasAda
tomAra caraNe Ami ki kainu aparAdha

"The favor You have shown KamalAkAnta is so great that even to Me You have never shown such favor. What offense have I committed at Your lotus feet so as not to be shown such favor?" CC 1.12.45 [Advaita Acarya]

zrIvAsa paNDitera sthAne Ache aparAdha
tathA yAha, teGho yadi karena prasAda
tabe tora habe ei pApa-vimocana
yadi punaH aiche nAhi kara AcaraNa

"You have committed an offense at the lotus feet of zrIvAsa ThAkura," the Lord said. "First you must go there and beg for his mercy, and then if he gives you his blessings and you do not commit such sins again, you will be freed from these reactions." CC 1.17.57-58 [Gopala Capala]

haridAsa ThAkurere karila prasAda
AcArya-sthAne mAtAra khaNDaIla aparAdha
After this incident the Lord blessed HaridAsa ThAkura and vanquished the
offense of His mother at the home of Advaita AcArya. CC 1.17.71 [Sacimata]

zrIvAse kahena prabhu kariyA viSAda
loka bhaya pAya,—mora haya aparAdha
The Lord became morose and said to zrIvAsa ThAkura, “When I adopted the
mood of Lord NRsiMha-deva, people were greatly afraid. Therefore I stopped,
since causing fear among people is an offense.”
CC 1.17.95 [Gauranga]; 17.97: not aparAdha

pASaNDI nindaka Asi’ paDilA caraNe
aparAdha kSami’ tAre dila kRSNa-preme
Many atheists and blasphemers came and fell at the lotus feet of the Lord, and
the Lord in return excused them and gave them love of KRSNa. CC 2.1.154
[atheists etc.]

mora aparAdhe tomAra daNDa ha-ila khaNDa
ye ucita haya, mora kara tAra daNDa”
“It is certainly because of My offense that Your staff was broken. Now You can
punish Me on this account as You think proper.” CC 2.5.151 [Nitai]

‘iGho ta’ sAkSAAt kRSNa,—muJi nA jAniyA
mahA-aparAdha kainu garvita ha-iyA’
“Caitanya MahAprabhu is certainly Lord KRSNa Himself. Because I could not
understand Him and was very proud of my own learning, I have committed
many offenses.” CC 2.6.200 [Sarvabhauma Bhattacharya]

tumi ta’ Izvara sAkSAAt, kSama aparAdha
jIyAo AmAra guru, karaha prasAda
They all prayed to Lord zrI Caitanya MahAprabhu, addressing Him as the
Supreme Personality of Godhead Himself and saying, “Sir, please excuse our
offense. Please have mercy upon us and bring our spiritual master back to life.”
CC 2.9.58 [Buddhists]

svarUpa kahe,-prabhu, mora kSama’ aparAdha
tomA chADi’ anyatra genu, karinu pramAda
SvarUpa said, “My dear Lord, please excuse my offense. I gave up Your
company to go elsewhere, and that was my great mistake. CC 2.10.123 [Svarupa
Damodara]

ei aparAdhe mora kAhAG habe gati
tomAra 'gauDIyA' kare eteka phaijati!

“I now do not know what My destination is because of this offense. Indeed, your Bengali VaiSNava has greatly implicated Me.” CC 2.12.127 [Gauranga]

ei vastra mAtAke diha', ei saba prasAda
daNDavat kari' AmAra kSamAiha aparAdha

“Take this prasAdam of Lord JagannAtha's and this cloth and deliver them to My mother, zaIdevI. After offering her obeisances, please request her to excuse My offenses. CC 2.15.47 [Gauranga's humility]

nindA karAite tomA Aninu nija-ghare
ei aparAdha, prabhu, kSamA kara more

“I brought You to my home just to have You blasphemed. This is a great offense. Please excuse me. I beg Your pardon.” CC 2.15.256 [Sarvabhauma Bhattacharya]; 257: not aparadha

sei rAtre amogha kAhAG palAJA gela
prAtaH-kAle tAra visUcika-vyAdhi haila

That night Amogha, SARvabhauma BhaTTAcArya's son-in-law, fled, and in the morning he immediately fell sick with cholera.

CC 2.15.266 [Amogha's cholera as a reaction to aparadha]

Izvare ta' aparAdha phale tata-kSaNa
eta bali' paDe dui zAstrera vacana

“When one offends the Supreme Personality of Godhead, karma immediately takes effect.” After saying this, he recited two verses from the revealed scripture. CC 2.15.268; 269 (MBh), 270 (SB)

prabhura caraNe dhari' karaye vinaya
aparAdha kSama more, prabhu, dayAmaya

Amogha then fell before the Lord's lotus feet and submissively said, “O merciful Lord, please excuse my offense.”

CC 2.15.280 [Amogha's repentance]

ebe 'vaiSNava' haila, tAra gela 'aparAdha'
tAhAra upare ebe karaha prasAda

“Now that he has become a VaiSNava, he is offenseless. You can bestow your mercy upon him without hesitation.”

CC 2.15.292 [Vaisnava as offenseless]

yadi vaiSNava-aparAdha uThe hAtI mAtA
upADe vA chiNDe, tAra zukhi' yAya pAtA

“If the devotee commits an offense at the feet of a VaiSNava while cultivating the creeper of devotional service in the material world, his offense is compared to a mad elephant that uproots the creeper and breaks it. In this way the leaves of the creeper are dried up. CC 2.19.156 [Vaisnava can commit offenses]

’bhaktye jIvan-mukta’ guNAkRSTa haJA kRSNa bhaje
zuSka-jJAne jIvan-mukta aparAdhe adho maje

“Those who are liberated by devotional service become more and more attracted by the transcendental qualities of KRSNa. Thus they engage in His service. Those who are liberated by the speculative process eventually fall down again due to offensive activity. CC 2.24.130 [liberated jnanis fall down, as per SB 10.2.32]

teGho kahe, ‘tomAra pUrve nindA-aparAdha ye karila
tomAra caraNa-sparze, saba kSaya gela

PrakAZAnanda SarasvatI replied, “Formerly I committed many offenses against You by blaspheming You, but now the effects of my offenses are counteracted by my touching Your lotus feet. CC 2.25.75 [Prakasananda Sarasvati]

jIvan-muktA api punar
yAnti saMsAra-vAsanAm
yady acintya-mahA-zaktau
bhagavaty aparAdhinaH

“If a person considered liberated in this life commits offenses against the reservoir of inconceivable potencies, the Supreme Personality of Godhead, he will again fall down and desire the material atmosphere for material enjoyment.’ CC 2.25.76

sa vai bhagavataH zrImat-
pAda-sparza-hatAzubhaH
bheje sarpa-vapur hitvA
rUpaM vidyAdharArcitam

“Being touched by the lotus feet of zrI KRSNa, that serpent was immediately freed from the reactions of his sinful life. Thus the serpent gave up his body and assumed the body of a beautiful VidyAdhara demigod.” CC 2.25.77 (SB 10.34.9)

zivAnanda kukkura dekhi’ daNDavat kailA
dainya kari’ nija aparAdha kSamAILA

When he saw the dog sitting in that way and chanting the name of KRSNa, zivAnanda, because of his natural humility, immediately offered his obeisances to the dog just to counteract his offenses to it. CC 3.1.31 [Sivananda Sena]

'Izvara-svabhAva'—bhaktera nA laya aparAdha
alpa-sevA bahu mAne Atma-paryanta prasAda
Characteristically, the Supreme Personality of Godhead does not take seriously
an offense committed by a pure devotee. The Lord accepts whatever small
service a devotee renders as being such a great service that He is prepared to
give even Himself, what to speak of other benedictions. CC 3.1.107

“kon aparAdha, prabhu, kaila haridAsa?
ki lAgiyA dvAra-mAnA, kare upavAsa?”
prabhu kahe,—“vairAgI kare prakRti sambhASaNa
dekhite nA pAroG Ami tAhAra vadana
“alpa aparAdha, prabhu karaha prasAda
ebe zikSA ha-ila nA karibe aparAdha“
prabhu kahe,—“mora vaza nahe mora mana
prakRti-sambhASI vairAgI nA kare darzana
nija kArye yAha sabe, chADa vRthA kathA
punaH yadi kaha AmA nA dekhibe hethA“
CC 3.2.116,117,123,124,125 [Chota Haridasa]

CC 3.3.144-164 [Ramacandra Khan aparadhas]

aparAdha haya mora, nAhika nistAra
jagannAtheha nA dekhiye,—e duHkha apAra
“hita lAgi' AINU muJi, haila viparIta
sevA-yogyA nahi, aparAdha karoG niti niti
sahaje nIca-jAti muJi, duSTa, 'pApAzaya'
more tumi chuGile mora aparAdha haya
bIbhatsa sparzite nA kara ghRNA-leze
ei aparAdhe mora habe sarva-nAze
“In this way I am committing offenses at His lotus feet, and from these offenses
I shall certainly not be delivered. At the same time, I cannot see Lord
JagannAtha. This is my great unhappiness.
“I came here for my benefit,” he said, “but I see that I am getting just the
opposite. I am unfit to render service. I simply commit offenses day after day.
“By nature I am lowborn. I am a contaminated reservoir of sinful activities. If
You touch me, Sir, that will be a great offense on my part.
“My dear Sir, You do not have even a pinch of aversion to touching my body,
which is in a horrible condition. Because of this offense, everything auspicious
will be vanquished for me. CC 3.4.139,151,152,154 [Sanatana Gosvami]

“bahu-kSaNa AilA, more keha nA kahila
tomAra caraNe mora aparAdha ha-ila

“Sir, you came here long ago, but no one informed me. Therefore I have certainly become an offender at your lotus feet. CC 3.5.29 [Pradyumna Misra]

dui-ThAJi aparAdhe pAibi durgati!
atattva-jJa ‘tattva’ varNe, tAra ei rIti!
Ara eka kariyAcha parama ‘pramAda’!
deha-dehi-bheda Izvare kaile ‘aparAdha’!

SvarUpa DAModara continued, “Because you have committed an offense to Lord JagannAtha and zrI Caitanya MahAprabhu, you will attain a hellish destination. You do not know how to describe the Absolute Truth, but nevertheless you have tried to do so. Therefore you must be condemned. “You are in complete illusion, for you have distinguished between the body and the soul of His Lordship {Lord JagannAtha or zrI Caitanya MahAprabhu}. That is a great offense. CC 3.5.120,121 [a Bengali poet]

aparAdha kainu, kSama, la-inu zaraNa
kRpA kari’ mora mAthe dharaha caraNa“
aparAdha chADi’ kara kRSNa-saGkIrtana
acirAt pAbe tabe kRSNera caraNa“

“My dear Lord, I have committed offenses. Please excuse me. I seek shelter of You. Please be merciful unto me by placing Your lotus feet on my head.”
“Abandoning your offenses, chant the Hare KRSNa mahA-mantra, the holy names of the Lord. Then very soon you will achieve shelter at the lotus feet of KRSNa.” CC 3.7.130,137 [Vallabha Bhatta]

ei ye zrI-mAdhavendra zrIpAda upekSA karila
sei aparAdhe iGhAra ‘vAsana’ janmila
RAMacandra PurI was thus denounced by MAdhavendra PurI. Due to his offense, gradually material desire appeared within him. CC 3.8.26 [Ramacandra Puri], purport with aparadha quotes:

This is confirmed in the Bhakti-sandarbha (111), wherein it is said:

jIvan-muktA api punar yAnti saMsAra-vAsanAm
yady acintya-mahA-zaktau bhagavaty aparAdhinaH

“Even though one is liberated in this life, if one offends the Supreme Personality of Godhead he falls down in the midst of material desires, of which dry speculation about spiritual realization is one.”

In his Laghu-toSaNI commentary on zrImad-BhAgavatam (10.2.32), JIva GosvAmI says:

jIvan-muktA api punar bandhanaM yAnti karmabhiH
yady acintya-mahA-zaktau bhagavaty aparAdhinaH

“Even if one is liberated in this life, he becomes addicted to material desires because of offenses to the Supreme Personality of Godhead.”

A similar quotation from one of the PurANas also appears in the ViSNU-bhakti-candrodaya:

jivAn-muktAH prapadyante kvacit saMsAra-vAsanAm
yogino na vilipyante karmabhir bhagavat-parAH

“Even liberated souls sometimes fall down to material desires, but those who fully engage in devotional service to the Supreme Personality of Godhead are not affected by such desires.”

’sevA’ lAgi’ koTi ’aparAdha’ nAhi gaNi
sva-nimitta ’aparAdhAbhAse’ bhaya mAni“

“I would not mind committing hundreds and thousands of offenses for the service of the Lord, but I greatly fear committing even a glimpse of an offense for my own self.” CC 3.10.96 [Govinda]

“Aji more bhRtya kari’ aGgIkAra kailA
yemana aparAdha bhRtyera, yogya phala dilA

“Today You have accepted me as Your servant and have properly punished me for my offense.

CC 3.12.27 [Sivananda Sena]

removing aparadhas:

CC 1.17.124-226 Chand Kazi lila against all aparadhas

praNatite ha’be ihAra aparAdha kSaya
nirmala hRdaye bhakti karAiba udaya

“Offering obeisances will relieve them of all the reactions to their offenses. Then, by My grace, devotional service [bhakti] will awaken in their pure hearts.
CC 1.17.266

pASaNDI nindaka Asi’ paDilA caraNe
aparAdha kSami’ tAre dila kRSNa-preme

Many atheists and blasphemers came and fell at the lotus feet of the Lord, and the Lord in return excused them and gave them love of KRSNa. CC 2.1.154

